



University of California
San Francisco

Program Evaluation: Tips and Tricks to Develop A Comprehensive Evaluation Plan

Arianne Teherani

<https://meded21.ucsf.edu/>



#UCSFMedEd21

Disclosures

We have no conflicts of interest

Learning Objectives

At the end of this workshop, you will be able to

- Describe program evaluation, its importance and purposes
- Identify models used in evaluation
- Identify considerations and barriers to program evaluation
- Describe the steps in designing an evaluation
- Develop the first steps in an evaluation plan

Workshop Agenda

- Introductions (who you are and why are you interested in learning more about program evaluation?)
- Brief didactic review of the purpose and importance of program evaluation
- Consider the elements of a successful program evaluation design
- Develop and discuss the beginning of an evaluation plan to provide you with framework for thinking through evaluation in the future

What is Program Evaluation?

Collects data or evidence on the value or worth of a program, the process, or techniques

Systematic collection of information about a broad range of topics for use by specific people for a variety of purposes

The collection and analysis of quality information for decision makers

What are the Purposes of Program Evaluation?

- Maintain and improve services
- Protect citizens
- To improve program/ *Help* decide to replace, develop further, eliminate, accredit
- To determine next step/make decisions
- To measure reliability, cost-effectiveness, efficiency, safety, ease of use
- To determine effectiveness
- To measure outcomes

For curricular purposes, evaluation *helps*

- Ensure teaching is meeting learner's needs
 - Identify where teaching can be improved
 - Inform the allocation of resources
 - Provide support to faculty and learners
 - Diagnose and document program strengths and weaknesses
 - Articulate what is valued by the institution
 - Determine that educational objectives met
 - Examine program goals, structure and process
-

Program Evaluation Definitions

- Formative (process) evaluation –
 - focused on process of the activity being evaluated; on-going; allows for changes to be made in process
- Summative (outcomes) evaluation –
 - focused on the outcomes of the activity
- Assessment –
 - measure of individual performance

Program Evaluation Definitions

- Program objectives:
 - Overall goal of program is to fulfill
- Learner objectives:
 - Knowledge, skill, or attitudinal objectives program will impart to learners
- Evaluation objectives:
 - Objective or goals of the evaluation plan

Influences on the Evaluation

- External

- Accrediting agencies
- Public
- Funding priorities

- Internal

- Who needs what answers?
- Who gets to pose the questions?
- How will the answers be made known?

Models for Program Evaluation

- Goal Oriented/Objective-Based (Tyler)
- Goals-free (Scriven)
- Judicial/Adversary
- CIPP (Stufflebeam)
- Kirkpatrick's 4-level model
- Situated
- Connoisseurship (Eisner)
- Utilization-Oriented (Patton)
- Realist (Pawson & Tilley)
- Logic model

Barriers to Program Evaluation

- Tension between implementing and evaluating
- Lack of skills in conducting applied social science research
- Paucity of funding, time, and publication outlets
- Failure to recognize evaluation as scholarship and place in literature

Exercise 1 - Design

During the next 25 minutes, please complete the following for your own program (or one we will provide):

- Evaluation Background (5 mins)
- Purpose of the Evaluation (5 mins)
- Evaluation Users (2 mins)
- Evaluation Framework (10 mins)

We will walk through each of these sections before you launch into writing. *Responses are guides.*

Once you are done, spend 5 minutes with a partner discussing questions you have that either pertained to your project in particular or both of your projects to bring back to the group for discussion

Evaluation Background

What is the merit, worth, and need of the program?

- Merit: Does the program do what it is supposed to do?
- Worth: What gap (in the larger literature) in education is it filling? (brief statement – literature review to follow)
- Need: Why was your program needed? What need or usefulness is being filled by the program goals? Can you defend the needs for those goals?

Purpose of Evaluation

What do you hope to achieve by evaluating the program?

- Are you trying to improve the program, determine what the next steps are or make decisions about the viability of the program?
- Are you trying to document successes and outcomes?
- Will there be any other outcomes, not currently a part of the objectives, that are likely to be impacted via your program?

Evaluation Users

Who, besides yourself, will be using your evaluation findings?

- Learners
- Faculty
- Curriculum developers
- Administrators
- Agencies
- Other stakeholders

What do these users want from the evaluation?

Evaluation Framework

- What model or framework will you use to guide your evaluation plan and methods?

Are there any other components that you will be considering in your evaluation (e.g. needs assessment, documenting work with collaborators, program developers).

Typically in this section you would describe the summary of relevant literature about your program or studies on program similar to yours.

Exercise 1 - Large Group Debrief

- Overall reflections on process
- In thinking about what you wanted to achieve from the evaluation, how did you choose to decide on final focus?
- Any projects have a summative (keep or eradicate) program focus? If so, how did you deal with addressing that in the first four sections of your plan?
- As you wrote down your users, could you think of a logical way of grouping your users? That is, are there groups of users that would care to see similar types of information on your program evaluation results?

Exercise 2: Objectives-Based Evaluation

During the next 15 minutes, please list the objectives of your educational intervention (Table 1) in relation to your educational intervention, and fill in the table for how you will ensure each objective is evaluated.

Move back into your pairs as you go through this process. You can work individually and discuss with each other as needed.

Exercise 2 Definitions

- Objective. The objective or goal your program is created to achieve.
- Other Processes or Outcomes. Additional, not explicitly defined programs goals, structure, or processes that impact program implementation, improvement, adoption and adaptation. (Table 2)
- Method. Data collection instruments used to gather information on whether the objectives are achieved
- Frequency. Timeline within which you will administer the methods.
- Standard. Defensible standard by which you will determine whether the method indicates the objectives or goals are being met.
- Responsible person. The individual in charge of ensuring each method is executed.

Exercise 2 Debrief

- Overall reflection of process
- Questions

Final Considerations

- Next steps in the process – instrument development, analysis, reporting, and re-envisioning
- Resource allocation
- Confidentiality
- Access to data
- Consent
- IRB approval

In Summary

- Basic definitions in program evaluation
- Models
- Framework for designing an evaluation plan
- Guidance on next steps

In Conclusion

Program evaluation is a powerful way to prove or showcase the success of your program, curriculum, or intervention

A program evaluation can be most effective if its

1. Developed systematically based on what is known in the literature
2. Includes well-defined program, educational, and evaluation objectives
3. Built of a framework/model
 - Addresses whether objectives/goals were achieved
4. Developed in advance!

References for Workshop Teaching Material

Stufflebeam DL. Coryn CLS. Evaluation Theory Models and Applications. John Wiley & Sons, Second edition, 2014.

Patricia O' Sullivan and the AAMC Medical Education Research Certificate Program.

Kern, DE. et al Curriculum Development for medical education: a six-step approach. Johns Hopkins, Baltimore, 1998.

Kirkpatrick, D. Evaluating Training Programs: The Four Levels (second edition). Berrett Koehler Pub. 1998

Merriam S. Qualitative Research: A Guide to Design and Implementation. 2009.

Patton, MQ. Utilization-focused evaluation. Sage Publications, Newbury Park, 1986.

Creative Commons License



You are free:

- to Share — to copy, distribute and transmit the work
- to Remix — to adapt the work

Under the following conditions:

- **Attribution.** You must give the original authors credit (but not in any way that suggests that they endorse you or your use of the work).
- **Noncommercial.** You may not use this work for commercial purposes.
- **Share Alike.** If you alter, transform, or build upon this work, you may distribute the resulting work only under a license identical to this one.

See <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/> for full license.