Creative Commons License
Attribution-NonCommercial-Share Alike 3.0 Unported

You are free:
• to Share — to copy, distribute and transmit the work
• to Remix — to adapt the work

Under the following conditions:
• Attribution. You must give the original authors credit (but not in any way that suggests that they endorse you or your use of the work).
• Noncommercial. You may not use this work for commercial purposes.
• Share Alike. If you alter, transform, or build upon this work, you may distribute the resulting work only under a license identical to this one.

See http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/3.0/ for full license.
Session Objectives

• List the benefits of open-ended exam questions in testing higher-level cognitive skills
• Categorize open-ended exam questions according to levels of Bloom’s taxonomy
• Write open-ended exam questions that test higher level cognitive skills
• Construct rubrics that incorporate cognitive skill level for grading open-ended exam questions
Open Ended Questions: Rationale

Well-designed open-ended questions:

• Allow assessment of analytical and critical thinking skills

• Offer students the opportunity to demonstrate application of knowledge with “real-life” problem solving skills using their own language

• Promote deep learning rather than surface level study habits
  – more likely to focus on broad issues, general concepts, and interrelationships
Bloom's Taxonomy

- **Remember**: Recall facts and basic concepts (define, duplicate, list, memorize, repeat, state)
- **Understand**: Explain ideas or concepts (classify, describe, discuss, explain, identify, locate, recognize, report, select, translate)
- **Apply**: Use information in new situations (execute, implement, solve, use, demonstrate, interpret, operate, schedule, sketch)
- **Analyze**: Draw connections among ideas (differentiate, organize, relate, compare, contrast, distinguish, examine, experiment, question, test)
- **Evaluate**: Justify a stand or decision (appraise, argue, defend, judge, select, support, value, critique, weigh)
- **Create**: Produce new or original work (design, assemble, construct, conjecture, develop, formulate, author, investigate)
How high do they bloom?

• Exercise: assign Bloom’s level to example questions
Choose your verbs wisely...

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
<th>Verbs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Remember*</td>
<td>Recognizing and recalling information, including terms, definitions; facts, principles, theories; methods and procedures</td>
<td>Define, List, State, Label, Name, Describe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understand*</td>
<td>Understanding the meaning of information, including restating (in own words); translating from one form to another; or interpreting, explaining, and summarizing.</td>
<td>Restate, Paraphrase, Explain, Summarize, Interpret, Illustrate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apply</td>
<td>Applying general rules, methods, or principles to a new situation, including classifying something as a specific example of a general principle or using a formula to solve a problem.</td>
<td>Apply, Demonstrate, Use, Compute, Solve, Predict</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analyze</td>
<td>Identifying the organization and patterns within a system by identifying its component parts and the relationships among the components.</td>
<td>Compare, Contrast, Categorize, Distinguish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluate</td>
<td>Using evidence and reasoned argument to judge how well a proposal would accomplish a particular purpose; resolving controversies or differences of opinion.</td>
<td>Judge, Appraise, Recommend, Justify, Defend, Criticize, Evaluate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Create</td>
<td>Discovering/creating new connections, generalizations, patterns, or perspectives; combining ideas to form a new whole.</td>
<td>Develop, Create, Propose, Formulate, Design, Invent</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The meaning of words matters most

A patient with heart failure is started on lasix, and subsequently develops hypokalemia

• Explain the side effects of lasix
  = List (recall)

• Explain why this patient develops hypokalemia
  = Apply your knowledge of the side effects of lasix to this patient (apply)
A patient develops oliguria, with elevated urea and creatinine

- **Compare and contrast** pre-renal with intrinsic renal disease
  - vague, asks for recall of all you remember about both
- **Compare and contrast** how you would treat this patient if the oliguria was due to pre-renal vs intrinsic renal disease
  - Analyze the differences between the two causes as applied to this case
The meaning of words

A tennis player presents with progressive pain in the right shoulder, worse in the morning

• Describe the most likely diagnosis
• List the anatomical structures involved

• RECALL?

• Categorize the symptoms and identify the components - analyze
Application of knowledge

• To apply knowledge, need something to apply it to.... A situation, scenario, context

• In medical education, most commonly a vignette

• If you can answer the question without a vignette, it is most likely recall
OEQ’s: Potential Limitations

• Time intensive: permit only a limited sampling of content
  – *Pick content carefully (and BTW, all tests sample)*
• Can favor students with good writing skills
  – *But also promote writing skills*
• Students can go off on tangents or misunderstand the main point of the question
  – *Ensure question and expectations for answer are clear*
• Students can “guess” the application answer
  – *Ask students to explicitly state rationale*
Best Practices

• Link questions to course objectives
• Questions should be stated in simple, clear language and reflect the language that is used in course materials
• Keep questions free of nonfunctional material and extraneous clues
• Explicitly state expectations regarding length, detail of answer, etc
• Avoid separate questions that depend upon answers or skills required in previous questions
Getting started

• Select course objectives you want to test
• Write a vignette relevant to the objective(s) covered
• Create a question, and verify Blooms’ level for each item, should be “apply" or above
• Write a model answer
Check yourself

1. Bloom’s level – apply or above?
   *If you don’t need the vignette to answer the question, likely not application level*

2. Does the vignette contain important and relevant information for the question?
   *No extraneous information*

3. Does the model answer match the question?
   *Can you expect the student to provide this answer based on the question?*

4. Do the question and model answer match the objectives?
How well do they bloom?

• Review examples
Rating OEQ’s

• Rating Rubrics:
  – Holistic: to give an overall sense of student performance
  – Analytic: to detail where students perform well

• No rubric is perfect, and some subjectivity is inherent to grading OEQ’s
Holistic rubric

• Scores the answer as a whole:
  – Responses graded in terms of the accuracy, completeness, and relevance of the ideas expressed.

• Example: The answers demonstrates that student understanding is:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Well developed</th>
<th>Adequate</th>
<th>Limited</th>
<th>Low to none</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4 points</td>
<td>3 points</td>
<td>2 points</td>
<td>1 points</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Analytic Rubric

• Scores the elements of an answer and gives discrete points for each element

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Answer contains xyz all correct</th>
<th>Answer contains xyz with minor error</th>
<th>Answer contains xyz with major error</th>
<th>Answer is missing several elements</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4 points</td>
<td>3 points</td>
<td>2 points</td>
<td>1 points</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Risk: may lead to giving equal (or more) credit for recall vs application rather than favoring application
UCSF School of Medicine Rubric

Elements of both a holistic and analytic rubric, which allows for specific feedback to students, but also provides faculty flexibility to decide what constitutes a good answer.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demonstrate ability to apply/evaluate/analyze/create with appropriate and complete content knowledge</th>
<th>Demonstrate ability to apply/evaluate/analyze/create but limited content knowledge or answer has errors/is incomplete</th>
<th>Demonstrate content knowledge only but does not apply/evaluate/analyze/create</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6-5 points</td>
<td>4-3 points</td>
<td>2-1 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Meets expectations</strong></td>
<td><strong>Borderline achievement of expectations</strong></td>
<td><strong>Does not meet expectations</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Creating a rubric

• Create rubric when you write exam items, based on session objectives
• Rubric does not need to contain every possible answer, but provide an approximate guide
• Check that rubric matches question (and model answer)
• Use rubric to clarify and refine your initial question
Rate your bloomers

Does the rubric:

• Match the question?
• Match the model answer?
• Reward application over recall?
## Improved rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Demonstrate ability to apply/evaluate/analyze/create with appropriate and complete content knowledge</th>
<th>Demonstrate ability to apply/evaluate/analyze/create but limited content knowledge or answer has errors/is incomplete</th>
<th>Demonstrate content knowledge only but does not apply/evaluate/analyze/create</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6-5 points</td>
<td>4-3 points</td>
<td>2-1 points</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meets expectations</td>
<td>Borderline achievement of expectations</td>
<td>Does not meet expectations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Lists 3 appropriate different classes of antibiotics and justifies their top choice based on clinical scenario</strong></td>
<td><strong>List 2 out of 3 classes with correct mechanism of action, or all 3 with some errors or no errors but minimal application to this patient</strong></td>
<td><strong>List 1 out of 3 classes with correct mechanism of action, or 2 out of 3 with incorrect mechanism/ and or no application</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Wrap up

Please share one take home point from today's workshop